

**EAST ASIA PACIFIC WORLD BANK-CSO REGIONAL WORKSHOP
JAKARTA, 18-20 JUNE 2008**

Introductory Note:

An East Asia Pacific World Bank-CSO Regional Workshop was held in Jakarta on June 18-20 in Jakarta, Indonesia. Around 50 representatives of CSOs from 12 countries in the region as well as senior World Bank staff and a representative from the ADB actively participated in the event. The discussions were around four major topics: (i) the Food Crisis and the Region, (ii) the World Bank's Regional Strategy in the East Asia Pacific Region, (iii) Modalities of Engagement between CSOs and the World Bank, and (iv) Youth Unemployment and Job Creation. This document attempts to encapsulate the discussions at the plenary and breakout group sessions by focusing on the diagnosis and recommendations from CSOs on the four topics.

SYNOPSIS OF RECOMMENDATIONS

CIVIL SOCIETY RECOMMENDATIONS ON THE FOOD CRISIS

Recommendations from Civil Society

- **Shifting land use.** Among the prominent reasons for the food crisis is the shift in land use in agriculture from food to non-food crops and from agriculture to commercial or industrial use - this needs to be reviewed in the context of our work on agrarian reform.
- **Food versus fuel.** Increased bio-fuel production is one of the factors behind the surge in food prices. Concerns over oil prices, energy security and climate change have prompted governments to increase biofuel production and use leading to greater demand for food-based raw materials. The costs and benefits of this trend need to be carefully assessed.
- **Shifting from petroleum-based fertilizers could be a key element in addressing the food issue.**
- **Access to land.** A majority of Asia's rural poor are still landless or do not have access to productive land. These landless poor are the marginalized farmers and tenants. Governments tend to favor large-scale commercial agriculture and not smallholder agriculture. Ensuring improved access to land is key to smallholder viability.
- **Food producers are hardest hit by recent developments.** In Asia, some of the hardest hit by the food crisis are the food producers themselves. Development interventions must help the rural poor dependent of agriculture - they must be given higher priority.
- **Diversification of staple food.** Governments tend to advocate for developing homogenous staple food in its agricultural policy. This dependence on one staple food creates vulnerability and greater diversification needs to be considered.

- **Agricultural trade.** The world's top food producers are in East Asia, but a number of countries remain import-dependent to meet their food needs. The staggering increase in global food prices and export restrictions are making domestic food prices in these countries practically unaffordable to the average citizen. How can this challenge be effectively addressed.
- **Diagnosis of the root cause.** The World Bank should fully diagnose the root cause of food crisis in the region, whether it is caused by the unavailability of food or by imperfect food distribution policy. It cannot always be concluded that famine and food crisis is a result of food scarcity; it is a political-economy issue. For example, the famine in Bengal was not caused by the scarcity of food, but it is caused by the boom in food price, which government did not intervene. And thus food crisis is an economic-political problem and not a technical problem.

CIVIL SOCIETY RECOMMENDATIONS ON THE WORLD BANK EAP REGIONAL STRATEGY

THEME 1 – SUPPORTING MIDDLE-INCOME COUNTRIES

Diagnosis from Civil Society

- The World Bank should deal with the issue of disparity in every country it has active programs. The focus should be on distribution, not just growth. The quality of growth has not trickled down. Economic growth should not be at the expense of the poor. This is not the answer to poverty reduction.
- In middle-income countries, economic policies tend to put too much emphasis on post basic institutions that focuses on the middle-income group and up.
- More focus should be made on rural development. Migration to cities leads to more problems. When young people leave their hometown to cities in search for higher education, rural communities get left behind and this condition becomes unsustainable. This creates disruption in the social structure if there is no incentive to stay or come back.
- Child exploitation in the labor sector in this region is also still a problem. Many are not able to finish their compulsory education.

Recommendations from Civil Society

- There should be better linkage with other development players, such as the Islamic Development Bank, China, India, Korea, etc.
- The World Bank should help promote and influence emerging ODA players in the region (China, India, Korea) to provide better political space for CSOs. The Bank should also promote compliance to OECD standards on operational issues (such as on procurement, environmental-social safeguards, gender, etc). Same standard should be done through co-financing and information sharing.
- Incorporate CSO in project decision making (such as through a steering committee mechanism). This should be part of the loan arrangement, especially in countries without political space.

- The Bank’s engagement with CSO on country and regional strategies should be done in a sustained way (such as through an advisory committee at regional level).
- Include stronger equity based performance indicators.
- Engage religious leaders, academic institutions, and the media to address issues of development values amidst economic growth.

THEME 2 – SUPPORTING LOW-INCOME COUNTRIES AND FRAGILE STATES

Diagnosis from Civil Society

Diagnosics: Current Challenges Facing Low-Income Countries and Fragile States

- High unemployment, especially among youth
- Tension within families because of lack of employment or underemployed
- Constant wave of crime in the country threaten economic and social activities
- Weak public institutions, weak public financial management
- Weakening of local institution by massive influx of development aids
- Level of strength of CSO operation is generally weak
- Clearer identification and targeting of the poor in development programs
- Increasing income gap among the population
- Challenges in sustainable and transparent management of natural resources
- Inefficient centralized system
- The plight of vulnerable women and children in post-conflict era
- Constant friction within societies stemmed by ideological differences
- Government structures remained mostly centralized
- Unsustainable development growth, benefiting only the elite
- Increasing land speculation, large land ownership
- Scarcity of human resources
- Unpopular issues on hold because of legitimacy issue of national leadership
- Growing land crisis across the countries as the result of unequal access to land
- Shrinking CSO’s space for dialogues with government
- Weak political system, fragile democracy, divisiveness among the population, worse in the election process, weak rule of laws
- Media under constant threats, lack freedom of expression, access to information limited

Diagnosics: Current WB-CSO Engagement

- WB/CSO engagement already started, but need to be strengthening
- CSO started to implement project, with fund channeled through the WB
- WB organizes joint meetings between the government and CSOs

Recommendations from Civil Society

Possible follow-up actions

- World Bank support to countries must factor-in the local context
- Support the private sector, both the informal sector and SMEs by helping create an enabling business environment for them to thrive as well as technical assistance support
- Technical assistance for CSOs and governments in natural resources management, sustainable management of proceeds from natural resources, and in developing a long-term vision development plan for the sector
- Support a positive engagement between CSOs and governments at all level on access to land and agrarian issues. The World Bank, governments, and CSOs should engage in the discussion about land administration.
- Support the sharing of lesson learned among CSOs in the region
- Support regular joint analysis of economic and social conflict across the region
- Have a regional program for the next generation of CSO leaders
- Support CSOs in performing a watchdog role on public financial management
- Map indigenous political structure, and re-traditionalize it, update it and adapt it in rural communities
- Strengthen and facilitate access to funding for CSO activities
- The World Bank should draw attention on women/gender issues on its assistance strategies
- Reinforce and strengthen the application of CEDAW and Beijing Platform for Action for the countries
- The Bank's regional strategy should critically address the vulnerabilities facing women and children, especially in fragile states and post-conflict situations
- Promote participatory approaches to development (both in planning and implementation stage) at the community level
- Support the increased participation of women in the decision making process
- The World Bank should advocate for the right to access information, especially for rural communities
- Strengthen access to mass media as a channel to communicate to rural and remote communities
- On aid Effectiveness, the World Bank should work more closely with other donors to prioritize the issues of the countries
- The Bank should help strengthen institutions in charge of public financial management

THEME 3 – GLOBAL PUBLIC GOODS AND REGIONAL COOPERATION

<i>Recommendations from Civil Society</i>
<p>Climate Change</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">■ Vulnerability and Fragility<ul style="list-style-type: none">● Gap between problem and solution● Market may not be the answer● The poorest may be left out■ Technology transfer<ul style="list-style-type: none">● Farmers need info● How to empower the excluded● Governance - safeguards against BAU■ Trade Offs<ul style="list-style-type: none">● Different Countries, different policy options● Upstream vs. downstream● Mitigation may marginalize the poor and sustaining inequality
<p>Climate Change – How the World Bank Could Support</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">■ Information exchange■ Capacity building■ Experimenting on alternative approaches■ Addressing inequality issues■ Cooperative approaches
<p>Regional Trade</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">■ Small Country vulnerability■ Free market not always benefit all■ Need more reflection on threats and opportunities■ Regional labor market/trafficking and epidemics■ Yang and Yin approach■ Homogenization and diversity■ Cooperative solution in the region■ Model on socially responsible investment (e.g. India)

Avian Flu and Disaster Response <ul style="list-style-type: none">■ Cross border threat■ CSOs role in surveillance and responses■ Information and coping strategy■ Whistle blower protection■ State Responsibility■ Need incentives for information sharing Transaction cost
Other Issues <ul style="list-style-type: none">■ Pacific Islands vulnerability<ul style="list-style-type: none">● More GEF funding in the Pacific● Support the impact of HIV/AIDS■ Open Source information/ communication that can<ul style="list-style-type: none">● Stimulate innovation● Share information● New networks/Relationships■ From Consultation to Partnership<ul style="list-style-type: none">● Not only instrumental tools● How to agree on tangible results● How CSOs can monitor progress and use the information

THEME 4 – KNOWLEDGE SHARING

<i>Diagnosis from Civil Society</i>
Current Condition <ul style="list-style-type: none">● The capacity of CSOs in the region is low and lacking in independent think tank to facilitate knowledge exchange● The World Bank has global learning network, but this tends to represent the voice of educated, not the marginalized● There needs to be an efficient platform of exchanging knowledge and experiences within and among countries in the region

Recommendations from Civil Society

- The World Bank should support development communications, especially in promoting behavioral change on education- and health-related issues
- As a knowledge Bank, the Bank needs to do more to expose governments (national and local) to new ideas and innovation
- CSOs have some skills that government can not provide, there needs to be a platform of knowledge sharing between CSOs and the World Bank.
- The World Bank needs to involve CSOs in monitoring and evaluation of its projects. Without this, there is a tendency to keep information closely knit within the project implementing units. There needs to be a more transparent process in World Bank-financed project and this in itself is a form of knowledge exchange.
- The World Bank should offer small grants to CSOs that supports knowledge exchange and capacity building
- The World Bank should build capacity within academic institutions to reinvent itself as a center of knowledge exchange
- The World Bank has been supporting China since the 80s and the country learns from the experiences the Bank has to offer. And now China is sharing its development experience to other parts of the world. There should be a pilot project to capture this good experience.
- The World Bank worked with CSOs in China, namely through its technical assistance on youth in development and the HIV/AIDS program. This should be further expanded.
- CSOs should be involved in the development of World Bank reports.
- The experience with the Knowledge Development Centers (KDCs) –satellite network of the World Bank’s Public Information Centers (PICs) — in the Philippines should be expanded in other countries. These centers promote information and knowledge sharing in the community level.
- The World Bank should consider CSOs as an equal partner in facilitating knowledge sharing and policy dialogue. Inputs from CSOs should be considered and reflected when developing policies.
- The World Bank needs to understand local communities first. Knowledge should stem from the local context. Development initiatives that derive from global concepts and imposed on local communities tend not to work.
- The World Bank should look into establishing trust funds for CSOs. This may be the way to ensure the partnership among different development partners with CSOs. Government administered trust fund tend to exclude CSO participation.

Action Plans

- The World Bank should provide substantial support for CSOs, namely through long-term financial, technical support and capacity building for CSOs.
- The World Bank should encourage the involvement of independent think tanks for policy analysis to provide evidence-based findings and relevant knowledge to policy makers and Bank staff.

- There should be more involvement of CSOs in the development process, especially in monitoring and evaluation.
- CSOs should be allowed to play a watchdog role in overseeing public procurement.
- Information and knowledge sharing among CSOs in the region should be promoted with World Bank support.
- The right to access information and the right to association should be respected.
- The World Bank needs to develop a user-friendly information system and there should be regular consultations on World Bank-financed projects.
- The mechanics of knowledge sharing should be thought through. In other words, the “how”, not just the “what”.

CIVIL SOCIETY RECOMMENDATIONS ON WORLD BANK ENGAGEMENT WITH CSOs

THE PHILIPPINES

Recommendations from Civil Society

- Utilize existing mechanisms to facilitate knowledge sharing.
- Ensure that mechanisms of knowledge sharing are as inclusive as possible but inexpensive, utilizing the web technology for access of information and feedback.
- Engage government structures, specifically department of finance, in loan approvals.

MONGOLIA

Recommendations from Civil Society

- There should be a separate section on World Bank-CSO engagement in every Country Assistance/Partnership Strategy.
- Adopt as a rule an allocation of funds for independent monitoring of projects financed by the World Bank.
- There should be funding support for CSOs to enhance public accountability in the country.

THAILAND

Recommendations from Civil Society

- There should be a monitoring mechanism to ensure that recommendations from civil society get followed-up.
- To complement the World Bank's engagement with CSOs at the regional level, there should be country-level dialogue and the message from the regional meeting should cascade down.
- There should be a concrete mechanism that allows meaningful engagement to move beyond consultation towards dialogue and partnership.
- The World Bank should facilitate a joint learning program with CSOs, namely through staff exchange programs and mind-set exchange forums.
- CSOs should be empowered to review World Bank's engagement with civil society in the countries it has active programs.
- The World Bank should help create an information Create information mechanism that allows universal access to relevant Bank-related information.

CHINA

Recommendations from Civil Society

- The World Bank should continue its support for the Development Marketplace Program, especially in China.
- Compared to other international organizations, the World Bank's partnership with CSOs is more advanced but it should be further expanded.
- World Bank knowledge is key resource for many developing countries and should be packaged well.
- There should be a long-term strategy to engage with CSOs. The groups at the grassroots-level are not well engaged.

Next steps

- There should be a long-term strategy for CSO engagement in China at all levels.
- There should be a capacity building programs for CSOs and they should be involved in all World Bank-related activities.
- There needs to be a communications channel between the World Bank and CSOs at the local level.

INDONESIA

Recommendations from Civil Society

- The World Bank needs to look at the historical context of its 42 years engagement in Indonesia.
- The World Bank should account for supporting and legitimizing the Soeharto regime, especially in letting corruption and human rights violations happen while still making loans for Indonesia.
- The way to improve engagement is by disclosing all the documents from the past that shows all the corruption, especially after the World Bank's own admission that 30 percent of the loan was corrupted.
- If we want a partnership, have to involve CSOs in the decision-making process. Not just in consultation.
- The World Bank should ensure high-level participation in its engagement with CSOs and not only dispatch its junior staff. All country offices should also be well staffed to look after its commitment to engage with CSOs.
- For many years CSOs have been discussing and challenging the Bank to be more inclusive. Inclusive here means leaving behind past Bank's practices where decision is solely made based on information and analysis from the World Bank, and start making decision based on analysis of other actors. Even though the World Bank has now opened its door to CSOs, but the nature of the meeting is consultancy -- a process where CSOs have no control of how the input and feedback is used. The World Bank should bring CSOs to an equal footing and be an equal partner (i.e. involve CSOs in a joint decision-making process).
- The World Bank has to learn from other initiatives which put other actors as key player in decision-making. As an example is the UN MDG project. Led by Jeffrey Sachs, the project established a multi-stakeholder taskforce which developed operational framework for the implementation of the MDGs. The other initiative is the Indonesian experience in developing the National Strategy on Poverty Reduction (SNPK). The document was developed jointly by the government and CSOs. CSO's influence has made the document adheres to the rights based approach in combating corruption, including acknowledging the need for land reform and equal access to basic rights.
- If the World Bank agrees with the scheme of joint decision-making, then: (i) CSOs should be involved in the policy making team by taking part in designing the methodology, defining the scope of the problem, and developing the key questions, and assess the country-level problem; and (ii) based on country-level problem, the Bank should hold a regional consultation, where findings were discussed further. The regional strategy would be developed based on this consultation, and strengthened by academic background papers written by experts.

Next steps

- Broaden the criteria of debt cancellation, there needs to be a new mechanism/policy beyond the HIPC.
- Widen representation for all consultations, including diversity of all groups (women, rural communities, labor groups).
- There should be joint decisions and analysis.

TIMOR LESTE

Recommendations from Civil Society

- The World Bank should share the historical records on its engagement in Indonesia. The World Bank did nothing about Indonesian invasion of Timor in 1975. In 1999, the World Bank funds for the Indonesia social safety net program were misused to fund militias in East Timor.
- The World Bank has continued significantly to Timor Leste, however the government should maintain its economic independence. The World Bank should not try to get the government to take loans, but should use the oil proceeds to finance development.
- Future cooperation with the World Bank should focus on grants for youths to continue their higher education.
- If we want a partnership, the World Bank have to involve CSOs in the decision-making process. Not just in consultation.

VIETNAM

Recommendations from Civil Society

- The World Bank should promote a mechanism of information sharing mechanism through regular meetings with CSOs.
- The World Bank should encourage CSOs participation in the monitoring of its projects.
- Change in concept of Govt ownership of WB to multiple ownership
- CSO involvement in community development – eg steering committee process
- Capacity building for CSOs on internal governance; advocacy techniques
- Info on different models of CSO engagement

CAMBODIA

Recommendations from Civil Society

- There should be increase access to information, all project documents should be translated into the local language, post it in the local newspapers or website.
- CSOs should be involved in project monitoring.
- Assign staff to oversee CSO relations in every World Bank country office.
- Conditions on all project modality to include CSO involvement in the project cycle.
- There should be a clause on whistleblower protection on project legal documents.
- The World Bank should create opportunities for CSO involvement in overseeing the procurement process and there should be capacity building supporting for CSOs and the local media to effectively play this role.
- The World Bank should support CSO network strengthening at the national and provincial level.

THE PACIFIC

Recommendations from Civil Society

- The World Bank should help compile a directory of CSOs in the region to assist with the dissemination of information on World Bank-related activities.
- CSOs should tap into the World Bank network to help implement initiatives within the CSO communities.
- The World Bank should strengthen communications effort in the Pacific region. The World Bank's communications in the Pacific is limited.
- The World Bank should conduct need analysis studies for every Pacific Island Nations and help identify priorities for each country.
- The World Bank needs to extend its network into the rural areas and other sectors beyond CSOs to understand each country context. The work with the CSOs should be strategically placed rather than reinventing the wheel – use existing networks like PIANGO in the Pacific to do the work.

INDIA*

Recommendations from Civil Society

- The World Bank should think about how to sustain the effort of getting together – once a year does not sustain momentum and enthusiasm. Create a website by which to continue to connect across the region and share lessons and innovations.
- Let us not be prisoners of history of one country. Use all the minds to enhance cooperation.
- Write a proposal as CSOs for sympathetic donors for each areas of need, for example capacity building initiatives and improving communications platform.

**Ved Arya, Executive Director of SRIJAN India, also participated. SRIJAN was the only non-EAP CSO present at the workshop.*

CIVIL SOCIETY RECOMMENDATIONS ON YOUTH UNEMPLOYMENT

Recommendations from Civil Society

- Improving the quality of education and training will open up opportunities for quality employment. The education system should not only focus on marketable skills, it should include other aspects important to developing human capital, such as civic education
- There should be more funding and technical assistance for an education system designed for and by communities, such as community college
- There should be more support for non-formal education (for example on agricultural development, work with young farmers' network) and through learning by doing (such as through youth initiatives in development projects). Vocational training centers needs to be established in rural areas and make it accessible for young people and poor families.
- There should be a microcredit scheme specifically designed for young people. There needs to be more venture capital or seed funds to support youth initiatives, both for business and social activities.
- A National Youth Policy is urgently needed to serve as a road map for governments.
- Governments must have an internship policy to open up opportunities for youth in public and private agencies.
- The implementation of Labor Laws should be further strengthened through the involvement of CSOs in the monitoring process.
- Establish a regular forum between the government, private sector, and youth groups in order to exchange experiences and seeking employment opportunities.
- Establish offices for career counseling and all high schools should have a career counseling program for youth.
- Improve access to information and technology.
- Creating jobs for youth could be done by supporting small and medium size enterprises.
